

PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

MONDAY, OCTOBER 16, 2000

3:00 P.M., J. MARTIN GRIESEL ROOM, CENTENNIAL PLAZA II

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with Messrs. Kreider, Raser and Senhauser; Mmes. Borys, Spraul-Schmidt and Sullebarger present. Members absent: Messrs. Bloomfield and Dale and Ms. Wallace.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, JACOB HOFFNER PARK, NORTH-SIDE NBD HISTORIC DISTRICT

This application was first presented to the Board in a preliminary design review September 25, 2000 and has not been altered since the Board's preliminary review.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger second by Kreider) to accept the staff recommendation and unanimously approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the development of the park as originally presented.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS 1600 MADISON ROAD, ST. FRANCIS DeSALES CHURCH AND RECTORY

Urban Conservator William Forwood explained this is before the Board for the third time. On August 7, 2000 the Board approved the installation of fan coil units on the aisle walls of the church; the units were to be faced with the salvaged wainscoting. Beading details would be maintained when the pews were shortened. The applicant has since secured a quote of \$166,000 for the proposed work, far in excess of the original estimate, and was asking relief from the conditions imposed with the previous approval. The applicant proposed that the fan coil units be mounted on the wainscoting and painted a color compatible with the wainscoting. The free-standing units behind the aisle pews have been relocated to the opposite walls. Three Board members visited the site and suggested changes in height and location of the units; these determinations are included in the current proposal.

Ms. Borys said one of the things that makes this compromise acceptable is the variety of ways in which pews collide with other architectural elements in the church. Mr. Raser asked whether the East Walnut Hills Assembly was notified; Mr. Forwood responded that it was.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Borys second by Spraul-Schmidt) to accept the proposed compromise in light of the new information submitted and approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a central air conditioning system for St. Francis DeSales Church (as modified) with the following conditions:

1. That the system be installed with minimal modification to the pews, that the new seat/back supports be as unobtrusive as possible and that the beaded frame detail be preserved.
2. That the pews be shortened no more than necessary to provide minimal clearances between pews and fan coil units and to preserve the appearance of the butted joint.
3. That the final details of the plan be submitted to the Urban Conservator for approval before the proposed work is begun.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 523 MILTON STREET, PROSPECT HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member Caroline Kellam presented the staff report on a proposal to construct two decks at the rear of the property. It is in an R-6 Zoning District; both zoning and plan examiners in the Department of Buildings & Inspections have approved the project. Ms. Kellam confirmed that the project requires no Zoning variances.

The pressure treated wood first floor deck will be supported on wood columns and surrounded with a wrought iron railing; an existing window opening will be converted to a full light door. The deck and footer will be approximately 8" from the windowless end wall of 525 Milton Street, the neighbor to the west. The end wall could be accessed for maintenance from the deck if a section of the railing were removable.

The second story roof deck will be cut into the roof of a two-story shed addition at the rear of 523 Milton; the ridge, existing box cornice and brick sidewalls will be retained. One window opening will become a full light door. By code, the deck will require a railing; staff recommended that the railing be a uniform, minimum height and not step up the roof rake as proposed.

Ms. Nell Surber, owner of 525 Milton Street, attended a pre-hearing October 10, 2000. She was present at this hearing today and stated her reasons for opposing the project:

1. The first story deck is too close to her property line; she has concern about the fire hazard.
2. The first floor projecting deck does not meet the guidelines because it is not a cut-away roof deck.
3. Both decks invade her privacy by overlooking her property.

Ms. Surber said that at the pre-hearing, Ron Tisue, the owner of 523 Milton Street, volunteered to construct the first-floor deck of metal to alleviate the fire hazard. Ms. Cindy Tisue pointed out that grill use on wood decks may be prohibited.

After the pre-hearing, Mr. Tisue and Ms. Surber each spoke with Captains Long and Becker of the Fire Department after Captain Becker had made a site inspection. It was their opinion that the proposed deck would not pose a fire hazard, but they suggested that the deck could be built of fire retardant treated wood and that Ms. Surber could paint her soffits with a fire-retardant paint.

Mr. Senhauser said the question before the HCB is whether the deck is within the historic district guidelines; compliance with the zoning and building code is not within the HCB purview.

The owner, Ron Tisue, said the type of deck proposed has now become typical in the district and displayed photographs of similar, existing decks in Prospect Hill. He said some have metal railings; many, including the Surber deck, are not cut-away roof decks. Mr. Tisue admitted the two proposed decks might encroach upon the privacy of Ms. Surber's deck, but stated that he is as entitled to a deck as any other owner in the district.

Mr. Don Beck, architect and neighbor, said he is not against the issuance of a COA. He commended the metal railing, cut-away deck on the second level and placement of the decks less obtrusively between two buildings rather than at the rear. He expressed concern about a fire hazard if grills were used against the wall of 525 Milton Street.

Ms. Surber said there is a wind tunnel between the two buildings that is itself a fire hazard. She expressed disappointment with the quality of work and alterations made by Mr. Tisue at 523 Milton Street, including the installation of reflective glass in 1/1 windows with applied mullions, partial mismatched tuckpointing, extensive exterior wiring, in general, the slow pace of repairs and remodeling.

Ms. Sullebarger said that the sample railing displayed looks like a ground fence and suggested a different type of metal railing for the deck. She also suggested that the railing on the roof should be all one height and as unobtrusive as possible and that the railing on the lower deck should be removable for maintenance of the masonry end wall at 525 Milton Street.

BOARD ACTION

The Board unanimously voted (motion by Sullebarger second by Borys) to accept the staff recommendation and approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed decks with the following conditions:

1. The railings on both decks be simplified
2. The second story deck railing be a uniform height above the deck floor and the proposed stepped design be eliminated
3. The first floor deck be a minimum of 8" off the property line and have a removable railing to allow the end wall of 525 Milton Street to be accessed for maintenance
4. The final design be reviewed and approved by the Urban Conservator prior to issuing a COA.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1111-1115 BROADWAY, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Staff member Daniel Young presented the application for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of 1111 Broadway and for landscaping plans for the entire site. The Board granted approval of the demolition of 1111 Broadway at its September 13, 1999 meeting with the conditions that the applicant submit plans for

proposed new construction and landscaping on site. The applicant has submitted a revised landscape plan. He no longer proposes to construct a new dwelling on the site, but wishes to erect a new exterior stair on the side wall of the building at 1115 Broadway. Staff recommended that minor changes be made to the fence screening Broadway.

Mr. Paul Cmil, the developer, was present to answer questions from the Board. Ms. Sullebarger said she was glad that the original building foundations and cistern walls would be maintained in the revised landscape design.

BOARD ACTION:

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Raser second by Spraul-Schmidt) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the landscaping plan for 1115 Broadway in the Over-the-Rhine (South) Historic District, with the following conditions:

1. The proposed stone privacy wall, steel-and-oak gate and 2' iron railing at the front of the property will be deleted from the plans.
2. The applicant will submit plans for a new fence at the front of the property, preferably an iron fence set between masonry piers, for approval by the Urban Conservator.
3. The applicant will submit revised plans for the stairs leading into the adjacent buildings at 1111 Broadway for approval by the Urban Conservator.

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 1100-1104 RACE STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE (SOUTH) HISTORIC DISTRICT

Mr. Young presented the staff report on an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for this two-phase project that will include in the first phase the repair/replacement of windows and doors, the installation of a new awning, the construction of a new rooftop deck/garden and access way and temporary concealment of two existing windows with plywood, painted to match the building. A future application will be made for the demolition of a small (non-contributing) building to provide landscaped parking. Staff finds that the basic character of the building will be maintained. This is likely to be a tax-act project, subject to Park Service approval.

Bruce Robinson, Architecture-Design, owner/architect, was present to answer questions and present plans and elevations of the project. He said the alterations will blend into the existing building and have minimal impact on the exterior appearance. He presented sightline analyses showing that the new rooftop work will be minimally visible from the street.

In answer to Mr. Senhauser Mr. Robinson said that the color of the metal siding to be used on the rooftop addition will be a non-metallic lighter color, possibly medium flat gray, to fade into the sky.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Sullebarger second by Spraul-Schmidt) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of the buildings at 1100-1104 Race Street in the Over-the-Rhine (South) Historic District with the following conditions:

1. The wood window sash units on the south and west elevations will be repaired rather than replaced.
2. If the metal window sash units on the rear of 1104 Race Street are replaced, the replacements must be approved by the Urban Conservator.
3. The applicant will submit complete plans for the new metal-frame awning along Central Parkway for approval by the Urban Conservator.

PRELIMINARY DESIGN REVIEW, 515 MILTON STREET, PROSPECT HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

Ms. Kellam introduced Donald Beck and Eric Puryear, architects, who presented a preliminary design for renovation of 515 Milton Street incorporating a new addition in the open lot between 515 and 521 Milton Street. Ms. Kim Klosterman and Michael Lowe, owners, were present.

Mr. Puryear presented preliminary plans and specifications for the proposed project, including some recent modifications. The front facade of the addition will be composed of a projecting garage bay and a receding entry mass to create the effect of two smaller-scaled, connected buildings in scale with the neighborhood. The walls will be painted brick; the front wrought iron fence enclosing an outdoor living area will be shortened and placed on a stone base similar to others on the street. The rear facade will capitalize on the city view with large expanses of glass. The foundation of the rear wall will be split-face block; the rear garden will be developed as a terraced, outdoor living area. Mr. Puryear said that his façade is not obtrusive from Corporation Alley.

The Board complimented the balance, scale and proportion of the addition as a contemporary statement that emphasizes the fundamental design of neighborhood architecture. Mr. Senhauser suggested that the street façade could benefit from the simplicity of the composition and detail of the rear façade and that the two halves of the building could be stylistically unified. Although it is large, the new addition does not overpower the original building.

Ms. Klosterman said she is willing to work with the HCB to find acceptable garage doors, fenestration for the street facade and other exterior details.

BOARD ACTION

Because this is a preliminary design review, no Board action was necessary.

CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT SUBGRANT APPLICATION, UPDATE OF CITY OF CINCINNATI HISTORIC INVENTORY - QUADRANT 4

[Ms. Sullebarger recused herself from action on this item and left the meeting]

Urban Conservator William Forwood explained that this project to update Quadrant 4 of the 1978 inventory of architecturally and historically significant resources will be a joint venture between the Historic Conservation Office and the Cincinnati Preservation Association. This is the first step in a longer-range plan to update the entire inventory. The City is the applicant and will provide the required local match in kind personnel services; CPA will administer the grant, oversee the survey, coordinate the work of the consultant and produce all required reports.

BOARD ACTION

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Spraul-Schmidt second by Kreider) to endorse the proposed application for a Year 2001 Certified Local Government subgrant to update Quadrant 4 of the inventory of architecturally and historically significant resources in the City and to authorize the Chairman to express the Board's support by letter.

[Mrs. Sullebarger returned to the meeting.]

OTHER ISSUES

Ms. Sullebarger reminded the Board that on September 11, 2000, the Rev. Jordan applied for a permit for the demolition of the Walnut Hills Presbyterian Church at the corner of Gilbert and Taft. The Director of Buildings & Inspections is holding the permit for 29 days, the maximum permitted, to allow time to investigate possibilities for saving the building. CPA has offered Rev. Jordan assistance to help preserve the building.

ADJOURNMENT

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned.

William L. Forwood
Urban Conservator

John C. Senhauser
Chairman

Date